

Juan Pedro Monferrer-Sala and Pedro Mantas-España, *De Toledo a Córdoba: Tathlith al-Wahdāniyyah* ('La Trinidad de la Unidad'): Fragmentos teológicos de un judeoconverso arabizado, Madrid, Síndéresis, 2018, 224 pp. ISBN: 9788416262434. Cloth: €15

Reseñado por YASMINE BEALE-RIVAYA
Texas State University, USA
yb10@txstate.edu

De Toledo a Córdoba: Tathlith al-Wahdāniyyah ('La Trinidad de la Unidad'): Fragmentos teológicos de un judeoconverso arabizado is a critical edition of the *Tathlith al-Wahdāniyyah* ('La Trinidad de la Unidad'), of an anonymous text produced in Toledo in the second half of the twelfth Century. Firmly grounded in previous works by Van Koningsveld and Burman, Pedro Monferrer-Salas and Pedro Mantas-España assert that the *Tathlith* is an expression of the multiple influences of the Jewish, Christian, and Islamic traditions and that this unique cultural baggage necessarily contributes to the work as a whole (p. 8). They argue that the anonymous author draws not only on active readings but also on those innate cultural references that are part of the multi-cultural religious community that he represents and is thus, fundamentally, a Christian Iberian text (p. 37). The book is divided into two main sections. The first section explains the provenance, the importance of the text, and situates this work within the field of existing works. The second section is the transcription and translation of the text.

Through a careful study of the theological and Biblical arguments in the *Tathlith* Monferrer-Sala and Mantas-España decipher the process of the transmission of cultural, religious, philosophical, and scientific knowledge from Antiquity until the latter stages of the Middle Ages. The authors propose that there are two important aspects about translation during the twelfth and thirteenth Centuries that scholars often overlook. The first is, what they call, the 'internationalization' of knowledge at that time, especially religious concepts. The second has to do with the role of oral transmission. There needs to be a deeper understanding of the role of intermixing of Jewish, Christian, and Muslim understanding in apologetic and polemic writings (p. 18). They seek to tease out how the Christian, Arabic, and Islamic cultures, that coexisted within the figure of the Arabized-Christian, revealed themselves and contributed to their intellectual production. Monferrer-Sala and Pedro Mantas-España underline the idea that those Arabized-Christians were «plenamente familiarizados con las tres tradiciones culturales y religiosas monoteístas» (p. 22). Given the intimate familiarity of the Arabized-Christian intellectual with all three traditions, they were uniquely positioned to polemicize their teachings. It is equally important to know which treaties are translated, interpreted, and finally (re)transmitted and the role that oral transmission played.

Monferrer-Salas and Mantas-España suggest that the intellectual knowledge produced in al-Andalus, and especially of neo-Mozarabs, or as in the case of the text studied here, a recently converted Arabized-Christian of Jewish origin, not only reflects this cultural and religious mix but also an oral tradition that was accepted and internalized. Far from arguing for an idyllic coexistence, Monferrer-Salas and Mantas-España envision a coexistence that

was ever more tenuous and that put in relief the weak institutional powers and a lack of cohesive social norms (p. 21). The arrival of diverse religious doctrines forced the Arabized Christians to polemicize and reflect on the roots and nature of the various philosophical perspectives such as Hellenic knowledge, new-Platonism, Aristotelianism that all contributed to the theological understanding and formation of the Andalusian Arabized-Christians.

The authors respond to previous works that tie the *Tathlith* to several possible authors such as Pedro Alfonso, Pedro Abelardo and Hugo de San Víctor. They explore the idea that the anonymous author may have some tie to the circle of translators of judeoconvertos from Toledo (39). They propose that the *Tathlith* and the works by Pedro Abelardo and those of the judeoconverso translators construct divine attributes of the three figures similarly (pp. 41-42). They also situate the writing of the *Tathlith* in relation to Mozarabic writings among the *mutakallimūn* and their framing of the trinity (p. 45). In the next chapter, Monferrer-Sala and Mantas-España situate the text within Arab writings such as the kalam by Ibn Tūmart. In this section, the authors explore one by one the arguments supporting the idea of the *Tathlith* being a 'rationalistic' writing and whether it is possible that this work is a Christian response to Almohad thought (pp. 77, 78).

Monferrer-Salas and Mantas-España layout a complex relationship of intellectual interchange between peoples of the Iberian peninsula, including judeoconvertos, Christians, and what they identify as 'oriental Christians,' the *al-I-'lām*, and the *Tathlith*. They build on previous proposals by Burman and maintain that the anonymous author of the *Tathlith* may have a hybrid identity and was very likely a judeoconverso. The author must have been someone who was intimately knowledgeable of the Hebrew Bible and had been trained in Latin theology as a result of a possible conversion (p. 99). As a result, Monferrer-Sala and Mantas-España believe he had probably been a Rabbi or a *ḥakīm*, an intellectual. His conversion must have included a process of learning theological texts. Not only this, but the way in which is written *Tathlith* suggests to Monferrer-Sala and Mantas that the anonymous author must have been in contact with 'oriental Christians' that were familiar with Islamic texts such as the Koran and the sunnah (p. 103).

Overall, the arguments in *De Toledo a Córdoba: Tathlith al-Waḥdāniyyah* ('La Trinidad de la Unidad'): *Fragmentos teológicos de un judeoconverso arabizado* are extremely well built and illustrate how 'international' knowledge of the time is incorporated into this work. In their introduction, Monferrer-Sala and Mantas set out to demonstrate how the intermixing of the three cultures of the book actively contributed to apologetic and polemic writings. They were also able to accomplish their second goal of tracing the contribution of oral transmission in these writings. What is most compelling of this work is its completeness. The authors draw upon Iberian writings and events as well as writings and events in the Near East to fill in the story of the *Tathlith*. By doing so, they give a mature picture of the elements that could have contributed to this work and why. Thus, they bring more depth, and an almost three-dimensional understanding of the complex intellectual exchanges and identities in Medieval Iberia. Through this detailed study, the authors, Pedro Monferrer-Sala and Pedro Mantas-España masterfully reveal how intellectual thought was shared, how these works fed into and responded to each other, and how they were necessarily a result of the rich and complex socio-religious interchange and identities present in Medieval Iberia.